

Randall C. Budge (ISB #1949)
Candice M. McHugh (ISB #5908)
RACINE OLSON NYE BUDGE &
BAILEY, CHARTERED
101 S. Capitol Boulevard, Suite 208
Boise, ID 83702
Telephone: (208) 395-0011
Facsimile: (208) 433-0167

Attorneys for Idaho Ground Water Appropriators, Inc.

**BEFORE THE DEPARTMENT OF WATER RESOURCES
OF THE STATE OF IDAHO**

IN THE MATTER OF THE PETITION FOR
DELIVERY CALL OF A&B IRRIGATION
DISTRICT FOR THE DELIVERY OF
GROUND WATER AND FOR THE
CREATION OF A GROUND WATER
MANAGEMENT AREA

DOCKET NO. CM-DC-2011-001

**RESPONSE TO CITY OF POCATELLO'S
MOTION FOR THE DIRECTOR TO
CONSIDER THE CITY OF
POCATELLO'S PROPOSED ORDER ON
REMAND**

IDAHO GROUND WATER APPROPRIATORS, INC. ("IGWA") and its Ground Water District members, for and on behalf of their respective members (collectively the "Ground Water Users"), through counsel, and hereby submit the following *Response to the City of Pocatello's Motion for the Director to Consider the City of Pocatello's Proposed Order on Remand*. IGWA supports the City of Pocatello's proposed order and in addition to the findings proposed there, would propose the following findings of fact.

1. A&B is not suffering water shortage as supported by the testimony and evidence of Mr. Bill Kramber regarding evapotranspiration. Kramber Tr. p. 1103 - 1104, and p. 1112, L. 12 - 19 - p. 1113, L. 7 - 12; see also Exhibits 427-10, 427-11, 427-12.
2. This scientific evidence was corroborated by the testimony of IGWA's lay witnesses as well as IGWA's expert witness Dr. Petrich that established that B Unit farmers use higher amounts of water than the surrounding farmers who divert water under their private water

rights. Petrich's Sur-rebuttal at 2-3, 8-9; Stevenson Tr. p. 2068, L. 7 - p.2069, L. 7, p. 2075 L. 11 – p. 2076, L. 8.

3. IGWA's witnesses also testified they irrigate with less than the amount of water claimed by A&B. Deeg, Tr. p. 1067, L. 9 – 1069, L. 11, p. 1070 L. 8-18, p. 1071, L. 12-21; Stevenson, Tr. p. 2068, L. 12 – p. 2069, L. 7, p. 2074, L. 19 – p. 2075, L. 10, p. 2088, L. 2-11, p. 2113, L. 5-21; Carlquist, Tr. p. 2036, L. 14-18, p. 2039, L. 5-16, p. 2040, L. 21 – p. 2041, L. 8.; Maughan, Tr. p. 2138, L. 17-p. 2139, L. 13, p. 2138, L. 12-16.
4. Stevenson testified that his farming practices on the B Unit of A&B allows him to "replace water with management" because he can use up to 3 acre-feet per acre on the B Unit for a flat rate and thus has no motivation to use less water. Stevenson, Tr. p. 2102, L. 2-8. By comparison, in his private farming operation which is adjacent to A&B, Mr. Carlquist uses roughly 2 acre-feet per acre as does Mr. Stevenson. Carlquist, Tr. p. 2040, L. 21 – p. 2041, L. 8; Stevenson, Tr. p. 2069, L. 1-7. A&B claimed it needs over 3 acre-feet per acre.

IGWA is contesting the Court's determination that clear and convincing evidence is the proper standard in evaluating material injury in a delivery call; however, it believes that the evidence in this case overwhelmingly supports a finding of no material injury to A&B even under the clear and convincing evidence standard. The evidence shows that A&B is not water-short and not materially injured or suffering any injury to its water right due to junior ground water diversions. For this reason, IGWA joins the City of Pocatello in supporting an order finding that A&B is not materially injured under the clear and convincing standard.

DATED this 29th day of March, 2011.

RACINE OLSON NYE BUDGE & BAILEY

By: 
Candice M. McHugh

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on this 29th day of March, 2011, the above and foregoing was served as indicated and addressed to the following:


Candice M. McHugh

Gary Spackman, Interim Director
Garrick Baxter
Chris Bromley
Idaho Dept of Water Resources
PO Box 83720
Boise ID 83720-0098
Garrick.Baxter@idwr.idaho.gov
Chris.Bromley@idwr.idaho.gov

- U.S. Mail/Postage Prepaid
- Facsimile
- Overnight Mail
- Hand Delivery
- E-mail

A. Dean Tranmer, Esq.
City of Pocatello
PO Box 4169
Pocatello ID 83201
City of Pocatello
dtranmer@pocatello.us

- U.S. Mail/Postage Prepaid
- Facsimile
- Overnight Mail
- Hand Delivery
- E-mail

Travis L. Thompson
Barker Rosholt & Simpson
113 Main Ave. W., Suite 303
P.O. Box 485
Twin Falls, ID 83303-0485
tlt@idahowaters.com
pla@idahowaters.com

- U.S. Mail/Postage Prepaid
- Facsimile
- Overnight Mail
- Hand Delivery
- E-mail

Jerry R. Rigby
Rigby Andrus and Moeller
25 N. 2nd East
Rexburg, ID 83440
jrigby@rex-law.com

- U.S. Mail/Postage Prepaid
- Facsimile
- Overnight Mail
- Hand Delivery
- E-mail

Sarah A. Klahn
Mitra Pemberton
White & Jankowski LLP
511 Sixteenth Street, Suite 500
Denver, CO 80202
sarahk@white-jankowski.com
mitrap@white-jankowski.com

- U.S. Mail/Postage Prepaid
- Facsimile
- Overnight Mail
- Hand Delivery
- E-mail